



Section 106 Effects Case Study Report for the Carver Community Center, Escambia County, Florida

Submitted to:

Jones-Phillips and Associates, Inc.
2352 Arriviste Way
Pensacola, Florida 32504

Chronicle Heritage Technical Report No. 23-PC-00680

October 11, 2023

SECTION 106 EFFECTS CASE STUDY REPORT FOR THE CARVER COMMUNITY CENTER, ESCAMBIA COUNTY, FLORIDA

Prepared by:

Jason Newton, M.A., MLIS

Prepared for:

Jones-Phillips and Associates, Inc.
2352 Arriviste Way
Pensacola, Florida 32504

Chronicle Heritage Technical Report No. 23-PC-00680

Chronicle Heritage
916 E. Park Avenue
Tallahassee, Florida 32301

October 11, 2023

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Town of Century is proposing the demolition and reconstruction of the Carver Community Center (8ES04500), formerly known as the George Washington Carver School, located at 7040 Jefferson Avenue in Escambia County, Florida. The project is located in Township 5 North, Range 30 West on the United States Geological Survey Century, Florida quadrangle. The proposed undertaking is funded in part by a Community Development Block Grant from the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). Pursuant to *24 CFR § 58.2(a)(7)* and *§ 58.10*, the Town of Century is serving as the Responsible Entity and has assumed HUD's environmental responsibilities including compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act.

The Carver Community Center (8ES04500) was determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places by the Florida State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) at the local level of significance under Criterion A for Education and Criterion C for Architecture. The purpose of this Case Study Report is to document the undertaking's potential effects to 8ES04500, a significant historical resource, and to propose potential measures to mitigate any adverse effects.

The Town of Century has determined that the building is functionally obsolete and no longer demonstrates long-term physical viability as a school or community building. Further, significant rehabilitation would be necessary to bring the structure into compliance with various state and federal building and environmental codes. As such, redevelopment of the site is necessary, and both rehabilitation and demolition alternatives were considered. As part of the design process for the renovation, the town architect (Townes + Architects, P.A.) commissioned several studies on the building, including lead testing and a structural assessment. These studies have led the town architect and the Town Council to conclude that the rehabilitation alternative is neither feasible nor cost-effective. There is no feasible alternative to this demolition that meets the needs of the project, and as such, the proposed undertaking will have an **Adverse Effect** on the property.

Further coordination and consultation will occur among the SHPO, the Town of Century, the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, other potential consulting parties, and the public to fulfill the requirements of Section 106. Final mitigation measures will be arrived at through consultation and documented in a Memorandum of Agreement to resolve the adverse effect.

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	3
1.0 INTRODUCTION.....	5
2.0 PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND NEED	7
3.0 HISTORIC RESOURCE SUMMARY.....	8
3.1 GEORGE WASHINGTON CARVER SCHOOL (8ES04500).....	8
4.0 EVALUATION OF EFFECTS.....	13
5.0 MITIGATION MEASURES.....	14
6.0 REFERENCES	15
 APPENDICES	
Appendix A. SHPO Consultation Letter	16
 FIGURES	
Figure 1. Location of 8ES04500 on modern aerial imagery.	6
Figure 2. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 1, as it appeared during the 2017 CRAS, facing southeast (Cardno 2017).....	8
Figure 3. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 2, as it appeared during the 2017 CRAS, facing northwest (Cardno 2017).....	9
Figure 4. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 3, facing east, Courtesy of the Town of Century. 10	
Figure 5. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 4, facing southeast, Courtesy of the Town of Century.....	10
Figure 6. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 5, facing northeast, Courtesy of the Town of Century.....	11

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The Town of Century is proposing the demolition and reconstruction of the Carver Community Center (8ES04500), formerly known as the George Washington Carver School, located at 7040 Jefferson Avenue in Escambia County, Florida (**Figure 1**). The project is located in Township 5 North, Range 30 West on the United States Geological Survey (USGS) Century, Florida quadrangle. The proposed undertaking is funded in part by a Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) from the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). Pursuant to 24 *CFR* § 58.2(a)(7) and § 58.10, the Town of Century is serving as the Responsible Entity and has assumed HUD's environmental responsibilities including compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act.

The Carver Community Center (8ES04500), located on Parcel No. 085N302302004001, was initially documented as part of a 2017 cultural resource assessment survey (CRAS) undertaken by Cardno (Florida Master Site File [FMSF] Survey No. 24626). 8ES04500 has since been determined eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) by the Florida State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) at the local level of significance under Criterion A for Education and Criterion C for Architecture. The proposed undertaking requires demolition and reconstruction of the Carver Community Center (8ES04500), and in a letter dated July 12, 2023 (Appendix A), the Florida SHPO determined that the structure's demolition would result in an adverse effect to the property.

The purpose of this Case Study Report is to document the undertaking's potential effects to 8ES04500, a significant historical resource, and to propose potential measures to mitigate any adverse effects.



Figure 1. Location of 8ES04500 on modern aerial imagery.

2.0 PROJECT DESCRIPTION AND NEED

The Town of Century is proposing to demolish and reconstruct the Carver Community Center (8ES04500), formerly known as the George Washington Carver School, located at 7040 Jefferson Avenue in Escambia County, Florida. The existing building had served to support after-school programs for children and various social and community outreach programs. The Town of Century has determined that the building is functionally obsolete and no longer demonstrates long-term physical viability as a school or community building. Further, significant rehabilitation would be necessary to bring the structure into compliance with various state and federal building and environmental codes. As such, redevelopment of the site is necessary, and both rehabilitation and demolition alternatives were considered.

The proposed undertaking is funded in part by the CDBG program, which provides annual grants to develop viable urban communities by providing decent housing and a suitable living environment, and the proposed project will help accomplish this mission. As part of the design process for the renovation, the town architect, Townes + Architects, P.A., commissioned several studies on the building, including lead testing and a structural assessment. These studies have led the town architect and the Town Council to conclude that the rehabilitation alternative is neither feasible nor cost-effective.

In May 2023, Intertec conducted a visual structural assessment of the Carver Community Center. During the assessment, Intertec noted the following issues:

- Brick stem wall is deteriorated and needs to be repaired.
- All the sill plates bolted to the stem wall are deteriorated and need to be replaced.
- Approximately 60% of the floor joist along the stem walls need to be jacked up into proper position and structurally reinforced.
- Approximately 70% of the bottom plates to the exterior walls are deteriorated and need to be replaced.
- Approximately 40% of the bottom of the exterior wall studs need to be jacked up into proper position and replaced or reinforced.
- Approximately 30% of the floor requires removal and replacement (Intertec 2023).

While not necessarily structurally related, Intertec also noted the following:

- Approximately 50% of interior wall surfaces will need to be replaced.
- Approximately 20% of the ceiling surfaces need to be replaced.
- All exterior windows with surrounding wood framing need to be replaced.
- All exterior doors need to be replaced (Intertec 2023).

When looking at the overall project, Intertec estimated it is likely that the complete refurbishment/restoration cost would easily exceed 50% of the appraised value estimate, which will require the entire building be brought up to meet the 2021 Florida Building Code as required by the Florida Statutes (Intertec 2023). Based on structural components only, Intertec estimated the structural restoration/repairs/upgrades would cost approximately \$2,048,400, not including engineering and construction administration fees (Intertec 2023). This cost only relates to structural repairs and does not include addressing other concerns such as lead paint, microbial growths, etc.). Lead-based paint was also identified with the Carver Community Center (Nova 2023). Based on this information, the Town Council determined that the rehabilitation of the building is impractical and cost-prohibitive and that the demolition and reconstruction of the Carver Community Center is the best viable option for the community.

3.0 HISTORIC RESOURCE SUMMARY

3.1 GEORGE WASHINGTON CARVER SCHOOL (8ES04500)

Site Type: Structure

Build Date: circa 1928 (FMSF)

Dimensions/Area: 6,828 square feet (Escambia County Property Appraiser)

Modifications: replacement porch supports and some shutters; ADA ramp added

NRHP Eligibility Recommendation: Individually Eligible (SHPO, July 12, 2023)



Figure 2. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 1, as it appeared during the 2017 CRAS, facing southeast (Cardno 2017).



Figure 3. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 2, as it appeared during the 2017 CRAS, facing northwest (Cardno 2017).



Figure 4. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 3, facing east, Courtesy of the Town of Century.



Figure 5. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 4, facing southeast, Courtesy of the Town of Century.



Figure 6. Photograph of 8ES04500 – 5, facing northeast, Courtesy of the Town of Century.

Site Background: The Town of Century was established in 1901 as a mill town for the Alger-Sullivan Lumber Company. The company was formed by Pensacola businessman Martin A. Sullivan and Russell A. Alger, a former governor of Michigan. Century remained a company town until 1957, when Alger-Sullivan sold the lumber mill (*Ocala Star-Banner* 1999). The company had deeded a large tract of land, including the parcel containing the school, to the Board of Public Instruction in 1930 (Cardno 2017). The George Washington Carver School served African American students in grades 1 through 12 until the Carver High School opened in 1955, incorporating grades 7 through 12 in the new building. When the Escambia County public schools were integrated, students in grades 1 through 6 moved to Century Elementary School, and the historic school building became the Century Community Center (Cardno 2017).

Site Description: 8ES04500 (George Washington Carver School) is a previously recorded single-story former school building featuring Colonial Revival style. The structure was built circa 1928 and is 6,828 square-feet (including the entry porticos) with a rectangular-shaped plan and a gable roof covered with asphalt shingles. The building is balloon wood frame construction clad in drop wood siding. Its main entry is centrally located on its front (northwest) elevation and features paired, three-panel, four-light doors set under paired six-light transoms. Entrances are also located on the other three sides of the buildings and are also central to their respective elevations. There is a gable-roof projecting portico supported by two square wood columns on the front, and the two side entrances have small gabled porticos with square wood columns and metal railings. Fenestration consists of nine-over-nine, double-hung sash windows, ribbon and paired, although several of the windows have now been boarded. The building features a continuous brick foundation. The former school retains its architectural integrity but is in deteriorated condition.

Although the Escambia County Property Appraiser gives this building a construction date of 1945, the building is likely older, as it is represented on the USGS 1941 Century, Florida quadrangle map and also appears to be extant on a 1940 aerial photograph. During the fieldwork for the 2017 CRAS undertaken by Cardno that originally documented the building, it was noted that the appearance of this building was suggestive of a Rosenwald School. A Rosenwald School typically employed specific design elements and date to the 1920s and early 1930s. These schools were constructed through the Rosenwald Fund in an effort to provide education to African Americans in the rural South. The Rosenwald Fund assisted with 112 public schools in Florida between 1921 and 1932, including \$1,400 toward the construction of a six-teacher type school in Century (Bland and Johnson 2011). A prior survey of Rosenwald School buildings in Florida concluded that, while three known examples were built in Escambia County, none were believed to be extant (Bland and Johnson 2011). Cardno concluded that, despite the date provided in the property appraiser records, 8ES4500 was likely built circa 1928, possibly replacing an earlier public school constructed by the Alger-Sullivan Lumber Company (Cardno 2017).

The SHPO determined that 8ES04500 is **individually eligible for the NRHP**, and Chronicle Heritage concurs with this finding. 8ES04500 meets Criterion A for its association with the development of the African American community in Century and the Alger-Sullivan company town and for its connection to the history of education in Escambia County. It does not meet Criterion B, as it is not associated with any person who made a notable contribution to history. 8ES04500 is also eligible under Criterion C for architecture as an intact example of a possible Rosenwald six-teacher plan school. 8ES04500 is not eligible under Criterion D, as it does not possess the potential to provide further information of historical importance.

4.0 EVALUATION OF EFFECTS

This Section 106 Effects Case Study Report documents the potential effects the removal and replacement will have on the George Washington Carver School (8ES04500). The structure was previously determined eligible for listing in the NRHP by the Florida SHPO. The Criteria of Adverse Effect, as defined in 36 *CFR* § 800.5(a)(1), were applied to the historic property. An adverse effect is defined as follows:

An adverse effect is found when an undertaking may alter, directly or indirectly, any of the characteristics of a historic property that qualify the property for inclusion in the National Register in a manner that would diminish the integrity of the property's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, or association. Consideration shall be given to all qualifying characteristics of a historic property, including those that may have been identified subsequent to the original evaluation of the property's eligibility for the National Register. Adverse effects may include reasonably foreseeable effects caused by the undertaking that may occur later in time, be farther removed in distance, or be cumulative.

Examples of adverse effects on historic properties, found in 36 *CFR* § 800.5(a)(2), include but are not limited to:

- i) Physical destruction of or damage to all or part of the property;
- ii) Alteration of a property, including restoration, rehabilitation, repair, maintenance, stabilization, hazardous material remediation, and provision of handicapped access, that is not consistent with the Secretary's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties (36 *CFR* part 68) and applicable guidelines;
- iii) Removal of the property from its historic location;
- iv) Change of the character of the property's use or of physical features within the property's setting that contribute to its historic significance;
- v) Introduction of visual, atmospheric, or audible elements that diminish the integrity of the property's significant historic features;
- vi) Neglect of a property which causes its deterioration, except where such neglect and deterioration are recognized qualities of a property of religious and cultural significance to an Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization; and
- vii) Transfer, lease, or sale of property out of Federal ownership or control without adequate and legally enforceable restrictions or conditions to ensure long-term preservation of the property's historic significance.

The Town of Century's current plan requires the demolition the George Washington Carver School (8ES04500). In accordance with 36 *CFR* § 800.5(a)(2)(i), **the current plan will have an adverse effect on 8ES04500**. In a letter dated July 12, 2023 (Appendix A), the Florida SHPO confirmed that the structure's demolition would result in an adverse effect to the property.

5.0 MITIGATION MEASURES

As detailed above, there is no feasible or cost-effective means of avoiding demolition of the George Washington Carver School (8ES04500) while meeting the needs of the project. Demolition will result in an adverse effect to 8ES04500, and in accordance with 36 *CFR* § 800.6(a), the following potential mitigation measures are proposed to resolve the adverse effect.

- Preparation of a historical narrative for a Florida Historical Marker and completion of a Florida Historical Marker Program Application for the George Washington Carver School to be installed following the redevelopment of the site.
- Development of interpretative materials and exhibits to be utilized at the new community center. This may include, but is not limited to, indoor exhibits within the community center and outdoor panels that may be installed along the entry walk or other appropriate location. Alternatively, it could include online exhibits and interpretation.
- Completion of Historic American Building Survey (HABS) documentation for the George Washington Carver School or production of a high-resolution 3D model.

These measures are neither exhaustive nor final; additional measures can be arrived at through consultation with SHPO, the Town of Century, other potential consulting parties, and the public. The Town of Century will execute a Memorandum of Agreement with the SHPO and, if participating in consultation, the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation pursuant to 36 *CFR* § 800.6(c).

6.0 REFERENCES

Bland, Myles C.P., and Sidney P. Johnston

- 2011 The Phase II Survey of the Rosenwald Schools within Twenty-Six Counties of Florida. Bland & Associates, Inc., Jacksonville, Florida. FMSF Survey No. 18316. On file, Florida Division of Historical Resources, Tallahassee.

Cardno

- 2017 FPU Escambia County Pipeline CRAS, Escambia County, Florida. FMSF Survey No. 24626. On file, Florida Division of Historical Resources. Tallahassee.

Intertek

- 2023 Visual Structural Assessment, Carver Community Center, Century, Florida. On file with the Town of Century.

Nova

- 2023 *Hazardous Materials Survey Report: Century and Carver Community Centers, Century, Escambia County, Florida.* On file with the Town of Century.

Ocala Star-Banner

- 1999 Century, a Florida town, has special reason to celebrate. December 27:3B.

Appendix A. SHPO Consultation Letter, July 12, 2023



FLORIDA DEPARTMENT *of* STATE

RON DESANTIS
Governor

CORD BYRD
Secretary of State

Robin Phillips
Jones-Phillips and Associates, Inc.
2352 Arriviste Way
Pensacola, Florida 32504

July 12, 2023

RE: DHR Project File No.: 2023-3330
Project: *HUD-CDBG-CV - Carver Community Center 7040 Jefferson Avenue, Century, FL 32535*
County: Escambia

Ms. Phillips:

The Florida State Historic Preservation Officer reviewed the referenced project for possible effects on historic properties listed, or eligible for listing, in the *National Register of Historic Places*. The review was conducted in accordance with Section 106 of the *National Historic Preservation Act of 1966*, as amended, and its implementing regulations in *36 CFR Part 800: Protection of Historic Properties*.

Based on the information provided, the Carver Community Center, formerly George Washington Carver School, appears to be eligible for listing in the NRHP under Criteria A: education and Criteria C: architecture (Florida Master Site File Number: 8ES4500). The proposed demolition and reconstruction of the Carver Community Center would have an adverse effect on historic properties. As HUD's responsible entity for this project, The Town of Century is directed to follow the process described in 36 CFR Part 800.6, *Resolution of Adverse Effects* to complete the Section 106 process. To complete this process, The Town of Century should undertake the following actions:

- 1) According to 36 CFR 800.6(a), the Agency (The Town of Century) shall continue consultation with the SHPO and other consulting parties to develop and evaluate alternatives or modifications to the undertakings that could avoid, minimize, or mitigate adverse effects on historic properties. The Agency shall submit a case study outlining these efforts for review by the SHPO.

* A case study is a document that outlines the agency's efforts to develop and evaluate alternatives or modifications to a project that could avoid or minimize adverse effects to cultural resources. The case study provides a record of an agency's due diligence to carefully consider the impacts of its actions upon cultural resources. The document may also reveal previously unidentified but feasible alternatives that will avoid impacts altogether.

- (2) In accordance with 36 CFR 800.6(a)(4), the Agency shall make information regarding this finding available to the public, providing the public with an opportunity to express their views on resolving adverse effects of the undertakings. Pursuant to 36 CFR 800.11(e), copies or summaries of any views provided by consulting parties and the public shall be made available to the SHPO as part of the case study outlined in (1).

Division of Historical Resources
R.A. Gray Building • 500 South Bronough Street • Tallahassee, Florida 32399
850.245.6300 • 850.245.6436 (Fax) • FLHeritage.com



(3) The Agency shall notify the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP), 401 F Street NW, Suite 308, Washington, DC 20001-2637, of the adverse effect finding per 36 CFR 800.6 (a)(1). The notification to the ACHP should be similar to the project information submitted to this office and should include the following documentation as outlined in 36 CFR 800.11(e). The ACHP will advise of its decision to participate in consultation within fifteen (15) days of receipt of this notification or other request. If the ACHP chooses not to participate in consultation, the Agency shall resolve the adverse effect without ACHP participation and pursuant to 36 CFR 800.6(b)(1). Notification of the ACHP can also be completed digitally; information for digital notification is available at <https://www.achp.gov/e106-email-form>.

(4) If the Agency, the SHPO and, if applicable, the ACHP agree on how the adverse effects will be resolved, they shall execute a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) pursuant to 36 CFR 800.6(c).

(5) If the Agency and the SHPO fail to agree on the terms of the MOA, the Agency shall request the ACHP to join the consultation. If the ACHP decides to join the consultation, the Agency shall proceed in accordance with 36 CFR 800.6(b)(2). If the ACHP decides not to join the consultation, the ACHP will notify the Agency and proceed to comment in accordance with 36 CFR 800.7.

Our office looks forward to consulting with you to resolve this adverse effect. If you have any questions, please contact Alayna Gould, Historic Preservationist, by email at Alayna.Gould@dos.myflorida.com, or by telephone at 850-245-6343.

Sincerely,



Alissa Slade Lotane
Director, Division of Historical Resources
& State Historic Preservation Officer